VERBATIM NOTES
OF
COMMISSION OF ENQUIRY INTO CIRCUMSTANCES THAT LED TO THE COLLAPSE OF THE FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS IN THE 1990s
HELD AT
THE JAMAICA PEGASUS HOTEL 81 KNUTSFORD BOULEVARD, KINGSTON 5
ON
THURSDAY, MAY 5, 2011

Γ

PRESENT WERE:

COMMISSIONERS

Mr. Charles Ross Mr. Worrick Bogle

COUNSEL FOR THE COMMISSION

Hon. Justice Henderson Downer (Retired)

SECRETARY TO THE COMMISSION

Mr. Fernando DePeralto

ATTORNEY MARSHALING EVIDENCE FOR THE COMMISSION

Miss Judith Clarke- Attorney-at-Law

REPRESENTING JAMAICAN REDEVELOPMENT FOUNDATION

Mrs. Sandra Minott-Phillips - Attorney-at-Law Mr. Gavin Goffe- Attorney-at-Law

REPRESENTING MR PATRICK HYLTON

Mr Dave Garcia - Attorney-at-Law

REPRESENTING FINSAC LIMITED

Mr. Bryan Moodie -- Attorney-at-Law Ms. Danielle Chai -- Attorney -at-Law

GIVING EVIDENCE

Mr. Errol Campbell

1		May 5, 2011
2		COMMENCEMENT: 9:30 A.M.
3	COMM. BOGLE:	Good morning ladies and gentlemen. This
4		enquiry is now in session. This morning
5		we are to hear from Mr. Campbell on
6		behalf of FINSAC or representing FINSAC.
7		The last time Mr. Campbell was here
8		there were a number of documents that
9		Mr. Campbell should have provided to
10		this enquiry. I know that meetings were
11		held while the enquiry was not in
12		session and I hope that Mr. Campbell
13		would have, by now, gotten those
14		documents so he can present them to the
15		Commission. Additionally, I know there
16		have been some attorneys who expressed
17		an interest in questioning, examining
18		Mr. Campbell regarding their client, so
19		this morning we are going to be
20		requesting of Mr. Campbell the documents
21		that we requested from him before the
22		adjournment. So Mr. Campbell we ask you
23		to come forward. Sorry, may I have the
24		names of the attorneys present.
25	MISS CLARKE:	Morning, Mr. Chairman, Comissioner. My

1		name is Judith Clarke, appearing on
2 3	MRS. PHILLIPS:	behalf of the Commission. May I have a clarification of that
4		please.
5	COMM. BOGLE:	She marshalls the evidence on behalf of
6		the Commission.
7	MISS CLARKE:	Obliged. Perhaps it may be noted in the
8		record or counsel's record somewhere.
9	MISS CHAT:	Good morning. My name is Danielle Chai
10		and Bryan Moodie appearing on behalf of
11		FINSAC.
12	MR. GARCIA:	Commissioner, Dave Garcia, appearing on
13		behalf of Patrick Hylton.
14	MR. GOFFE:	Sandra Minott-Phillips and Gavin Goffe
15		instructed by Minott Fletcher and Gordon
16		appearing for Jamaican Redevelopment
17		Foundation.
18	MR. MOODIE:	Commissioners, before you begin I am
19		advised that certain documents requested
20		were in fact provided to the Commission
21		and I would seek confirmation that those
22		documents have been received, they were
23		letters written by Mr. Campbell to the
24		Commission and I think a CD given with
25		certain documents, other documents

1		provided, if Mr. Campbell could speak to
2		the documents that were requested and
3		provided and I would seek confirmation.
4	COMM. BOGLE:	That issue will be taken but we have not
5		sworn him in as yet.
6	MR. MOODIE:	As a matter of admin so to speak, I just
7		wish to make a brief statement
8		Commissioners. As this Commission is
9		aware, the firm Samuda & Johnson has
10		recently been retained within the past
11		two weeks to represent FINSAC. It is
12		clear that we are coming perhaps not
13		even mid stream but at the end of the
14		stream and we have faced significant
15		challenges which we have communicated
16		with the Secretary of the Commission.
17		Indeed we met with the Secretary, we
18		requested a further two weeks in order
19		to get ourselves and our client ready
20		and that request was denied. In fact a
21		summons was served on Mr. Campbell
22		requiring him to be here today. The
23		challenges which we face still exist
24		particularly FINSAC was previously
25		represented by counsel from the Attorney

L	General's chambers. We wrote to the
2	Attorney General's chambers within the past
3	two weeks of our retainer asking for all
4	transcripts, submissions and relevant
5	documents, and to date we are yet to have
5	the pleasure of a response. Having met with
7	the Secretary of the Commission he has done
3	his part to try and facilitate us and has
9	been sending us the transcripts which we
10	have been receiving on a day-to-day basis.
11	I just wish to note for the benefit of the
12	Commission that up to 4 p.m. yesterday we
13	were still receiving transcripts.
L 4	Particularly at 4 p.m. yesterday we
15	received transcripts relating to evidence
16	given on December 1, 2009, December 2, 2009,
17	January 12, 2010, January 19, 2010,
18	February 2, February 3, February 8,
19	February 9, February 10, March 1, March 2,
20	March 8, April 12, April 13, April 14, April
21	27 and May 3 yesterday. We also received
22	yesterday witness statements and
23	submissions for the following persons, sent
24	from

1 2 Ms. Tanisia Johnson for the Commission for 3 4 DEBTOR6, DEBTOR1, Elon Beckford, DEBTOR2, 5 6 DEBTOR3, Jeffrey Cobham, Jim Parkes, 7 8 DEBTOR4, DEBTOR5 and DEBTOR7. [NB. These 9 references relate to this document only]. 10 It appears, Commissioners that our client 11 will be asked to respond to some of the 12 allegations being made by some of these 1.3 persons who gave evidence but having just 14 received those transcripts, we are in a 15 difficulty having not been able to take 16 instructions from our client and to give him 17 any advice in relation to the issues that 18 have been raised. We have spoken to counsel 19 who appear for both Mr. Hylton and for the 20 Honourable Omar Davies and the Jamaican 21 Redevelopment Foundation and what we have 22 proposed, with their consent, or what we wish 2.3 to propose with their consent, in order for 24 Mr. Campbell to respond specifically to 25 those persons who have given evidence for which we are still digesting the transcripts, that he

be accommodated after the evidence of Mr. 1 Patrick Hylton. We note in the schedule 2 provided by the Commission that the week of 3 19th to the 27th of May so far is free, I am not sure if the Commission itself has a 5 difficulty but certainly according to this schedule we see Patrick Hylton I think confirmed and I asked his counsel, confirmed to appear on the 10th and 11th next week Tuesday and Wednesday and we have Errol 10 Campbell scheduled to appear on Thursday the 11 12th. As you no doubt aware they are copious 12 documents and I think counsel has 13 represented this to the Commission before 14 that we are dealing with some ten thousand 15 boxes worth of documents. Records which when 16 the debt was sold to the Jamaican 17 18 Redevelopment Foundation were put in their care and we met with them and have been given 19 20 permission to access those records but within the past two weeks having to bring 21 22 ourselves up to date with the evidence that 23 has been given so far, having to apprize

ourselves of the cross-examination that has taken place by some attorneys, particularly the cross-examination by counsel for the Jamaican Redevelopment Foundation, there are some issues which we would wish an opportunity to address directly and we have not yet had an opportunity to do so. In addition to which, Commissioners, there are some documents which are still being made available by FINSAC to the Commission, those documents include minutes of the various committees, in particular the Credit Committee where some of the decisions would have been made as respect to debtors or institutions and that information we believe is particularly relevant to the Commission. We are in the process still of copying those documents, they are perhaps about six or seven boxes worth of documents which we have discovered so far but we have not yet had an opportunity to properly digest the contents of those documents to respond to some of the

23

1	specific allegations as to decisions made in
2	relation to debtors or institutions. And so,
3	in that light, we would again ask the
4	Commission to, as best as possible,
5	accommodate
6	Mr. Campbell returning on a day and at a time
7	when we have had an opportunity to take
8	instructions from our client in relation to
9	those specific items, and to be able to
10	advise him as to the response to be given to
11	this Commission. We believe it is imperative
12	that our client be afforded an opportunity
13	for proper representation and having been
14	retained some two weeks ago we have made
15	every effort to come up to speed but as I have
16	indicated, as we are still in the process of
17	getting some of the
18	documents, some of the transcripts, our
19	hands have been largely tied and we have so
20	far done the best we can. We were advised
21	that most of the documents requested by the
22	Commission have been provided by Mr.
23	Campbell, what is outstanding still is the
24	list of debts

つに

1		forgiven, debtors forgiven. We have
2		compiled a preliminary list but it is
3		imperative that we go through those
4		Credit Committee documents which are
5		still being collated for us to have a
6		complete list and so that list is not
7		before the Commission today.
8		So I would ask the Commission to
9		indicate whether it would be disposed to
10		allow Mr. Campbell to return after the
11		evidence of Mr. Patrick Hylton is taken
12		which is set for the 10th and 11th of
13		May 2011.
14	COMM. BOGLE:	Mr. Moodie, your request for an
15		extension is a re-run of the first time
16		Mr. Campbell came here. It was the same
17		situation, very similar, that when
18		Mr. Campbell was called his attorney at
19		the time got up and said he was just
20		appointed a few days ago. This is a re-
21		run of that same thing. Mr. Campbell
22		knew from he gave evidence last year
23		that he would be returning or FINSAC
24		would be returning to this Commission,
25		not a month ago, not two months ago,

1	over a year ne knew that. We the Commission
2	will not take responsibility for Mr.
3	Campbell not adequately
4	affording himself of counsel during the
5	period. The Commission did not sit, I think,
6	it was from February last year until
7	November last year. All of that period the
8	Commission did not sit,
9	Mr. Campbell at that time knew very well that
10	documents etcetera, etcetera, were
11	required, requests were made of him. The
12	Commission restarted in November of this
13	year, sorry, November of last year. From then
14	on, communication, schedules had been sent
15	to Mr. Campbell and FINSAC and they were made
16	aware that the Commission was sitting, and
17	if they had interest they could have
18	appointed counsel and have counsel attend
19	the hearings as did other persons of
20	interest to the Commission, therefore, we
21	will not be granting any additional time for
22	Mr. Campbell to provide the necessary
23	information. Mr. Campbell will be asked today
24	for the information that

つち

1	we have asked for; to the extent that they
2	are not provided Mr. Hylton will be here on
3	Tuesday and Wednesday and
	Mr. Campbell will return next week
4	Thursday and we would expect
5	Mr. Campbell to provide the documents. This
6	commission can't continue to be off and off
7	and off, this Commission should have been
8	finished long time ago and we hear in the
9	-
10	press, we hear everywhere that FINSAC
11	Commission is just dragging on and dragging
12	on and costing tax payers money and we have
13	to call a halt to it. FINSAC is not only Mr.
14	Campbell. I am sure he has staff and if he
15	doesn't have staff, then I suggest he speaks
16	to the Ministry of Finance or the ministry
17	under which FINSAC falls and gets the
18	necessary staff to do the work but we are not
19	going to have any extension. We will do what
20	we can this morning in terms of getting the
21	documents
	presented, Mr. Campbell will return next
22	week Thursday and continue. So regarding
23	your request the answer is no, there
24	

つち

1 2	MR. MOODIE:	will be no extension. I appreciate some of the issues raised
3		by you Chairman. I am compelled to point
4		out that in the first instance I can't
5		speak to what may have occurred before
6		our appointment. Those are issues to
7		which I cannot respond and you will
8		appreciate that those issues are beyond
9		my remit. I can, however, speak to the
10		fact of our appointment and our duty as
11		attorneys who have been engaged to
12		represent a client is to ensure that we
13		take full instructions and that we
14		advise our client accordingly and properly.
15		In the time period that has passed, we the new
16		attorneys appointed for FINSAC have been
17		making every effort to come to grips with the
18		voluminous documents that have been put
19		before this Commission and the extensive
20		transcripts of proceedings. This Commission
21		will appreciate that, and as far as my
22		recollection of those transcripts which we
23 24		have received so far have indicated, that
25		FINSAC has not participated in the

cross-examination of any witness. It is important because those allegations which have been made so far remain untested as far as FINSAC is concerned. Certainly many of the issues which FINSAC would raise which come from the documents, from the files for which we are still coming to grips with, have admittedly been raised by counsel for the Jamaican Redevelopment Foundation and some of those issues as I indicated yesterday are issues which FINSAC would have certainly wished to bring to light but having not had an opportunity to cross-examine the persons or the institutions who have made specific allegations, we are not in a position to respond in a meaningful way to this Commission. I would think that the main remit of this Commission is to ferret out the truth, not only in relation to the allegations but in relation to the facts as the documents would establish in terms of the position of certain debtors, the process by which FINSAC

24

つに

1	dealt with these debtors. It is clear from
	your terms of reference that the remit of
2	this commission is to see whether debtors
3	were treated fairly and equally. In order
4	
5	for FINSAC to
6	respond, we as attorneys must have the
7	opportunity to advise our client having
8	regard to the documents which are in
9	existence. The two weeks of our
10	retainer have not allowed for that. We note
11	the Commission's decision but wish to place
12	on record that having regard to those
13	circumstances, as I have outlined, there may
14	be some limitations in terms of the answers
15	that can be offered by Mr. Campbell
16	specifically as it relates to allegations
17	made by those who have given evidence. We
18	have not seen the documents, we have not
19	advised our client. When we requested an
20	extension of two weeks and that was denied,
21	we thereafter and to date have sought the
22	Commission's intervention and accommodation
23	in terms of Mr. Campbell's appearance set for
24	next week Thursday.

つに

1		If it is he is set for next week
2		Thursday, then that is the date that it
3		is proposed that, unless any further
4		accommodation can be given, and I take
5		your position that Mr. Campbell would be
6		able to respond to the specific
7		allegations and I am not sure
8		Commissioners, if your questions this
9		morning to him would relate to some of
10		those specific allegations or only the
11		documents which were outstanding.
12		Would you be able to clarify?
13	COMM. BOGLE:	We will be dealing this morning mainly
14		with the documents outstanding because
15		from those documents, documents and
16		whatever information that was requested
17		of Mr. Campbell, that is what we will be
18		dealing primarily with this morning
19		because from those documents, of course,
20		will, I suspect, come questions for
21		Mr. Campbell through FINSAC, so that is
22		the main area we will be dealing with
23		this morning.
24	MR. MOODIE:	I am guided. I note too that from my
25		review of the transcripts,

1		Mr. Campbell's evidence commenced with
2		his response to the questions that were
3		posed to him by this Commission. I think
4		perhaps on Thursday when Mr. Campbell
5		returns we would wish the opportunity
6		for Mr. Campbell to give a general
7		statement because I think it is relevant
8		for our client to be able to indicate
9		his role within FINSAC, particularly at
10		the material time of the allegations
11		which are being made and to give some
12		background.
13	COMM. BOGLE:	Mr. Campbell will be willing to make
14		that statement today?
15	MR. MOODIE:	I think I would ask the Commission to
16		accommodate us on Thursday for that
17		statement because if we are continuing
18		and dealing with documents which ought
19		to have been provided and we are
20		carrying on
21	COMM. BOGLE:	Just a moment. On certain allegations
22		you made, the Secretariat would like to
23		reply directly to the matter of
24		documentation that you said you received
25		and when. Mr. DePeralto?

1	MR. MOODIE:	Before we do, I just wish to complete my
2		submission in relation to Mr. Campbell's
3		substantive evidence. His evidence so
4		far has been in response to the various
5		questions and I see that Mr. Braham who
6		was marshalling the evidence at the time
7		took him through those questions but I
8		think the normal process would be for
9		every witness or proposed witness to
10		give a general witness statement,
11		circulate it and thereafter, for, in a
12		matter of speaking, his evidence-in-
13		chief to be given and Mr. Campbell
14	COMM. BOGLE:	Mr. Moodie believe you me, and we have
15		correspondence, we wrote to FINSAC
16		requesting such a statement from in
17		2009. FINSAC did not reply, after
18		telephone calls etcetera and no reply,
19		that is when the questions were prepared
20		and sent to FINSAC. We are not
21		accommodative, we are not too
22		accommodative of FINSAC now. 2009 we
23		wrote and asked them to prepare a
24		submission to this Commission. We
25		followed that up with telephone calls,

Τ		nothing came, that was when we sent the
2		list of questions; since FINSAC was not
3		willing to come forward we then prepared
4		questions and sent them to Mr. Campbell
5		at FINSAC. So I do not know where or
6		what information you have gotten from
7		Mr. Campbell at FINSAC but I suggest
8		that Mr. Campbell should provide you
9		with all of the information because we
LO		wrote to them, requesting a submission,
L1		same submission you see that each
L2		witness would provide, most of the
L3		witnesses provided that, whether they
L 4		were bankers or whoever, they provided
L 5		that statement, FINSAC refused and so we
L 6		prepared a list of questions which went
L 7		to FINSAC. So, you know, all of the
L 8		things that you are saying were done.
L 9	MR. MOODIE:	I appreciate, Chairman, that the
20		Commission may have adopted a certain
21		attitude as you indicate that you were
22		not very accommodating of FINSAC at this
23		point and I appreciate that the
24		Commission must have a certain feeling
25		as it regards what they believe they

have received as FINSAC's participation 1 so far but again Commissioner, I make note 2 that I can only speak to the past two weeks. 3 Having been retained we have perused Mr. 4 Campbell's evidence and we felt it necessary 5 that a statement or submission be done on his 6 behalf because I think the context of his 7 response is important. We have prepared a 8 preliminary statement which we are in the 9 process of finalizing, it's not a very long 10 statement but it is a statement which puts, 11 I think, the entire matter into context, puts 12 Mr. Campbell's role into context, and 13 addresses some of the very issues which this 14 Commission is mandated to look into. The 15 terms of reference are very clear. In 16 relation to FINSAC particularly, the terms 17 of reference as this Commission is aware, are 18 to review the operations of FINSAC in 19 relation to delinguent borrowers and to 2.0 determine whether debtors were treated 21 fairly and equally. To answer that question, 22

24

23

つ「

1	FINSAC must set the background to its
2	operations. It must set out for this
3	Commission the manner in which it approached
4	the issues, how it dealt with institutions,
5	the processes within FINSAC in terms of how
6	the non-performing loans were treated and
7	the procedural issues which were undertaken
8	by FINSAC. Certainly these issues will be
9	directly relevant to this Commission being
10	able to determine whether debtors were
11	treated fairly and equally. And I submit to
12	you that answers to specific questions posed
13	by this Commission cannot by itself do so.
14	Secondly, the terms of reference include, to
15	review the probative and propriety in
16	FINSAC's management sale and/or disposal of
17	assets relating to delinquent borrowers.
18	Again, the context would be important
19	because what I get from the transcripts is
20	that this Commission is particularly
21	concerned as to whether or not there were
22	certain policies in place, whether these
23	were

written policies, whether or not there were interventions by other interests or other persons or institutions and the general way in which FINSAC approached its mandate, to that extent Commission, I submit that albeit late, a submission or statement from Mr. Campbell would be of invaluable assistance to this Commission in seeking to carry out its mandate. And I submit Chairman, that even at this late stage - I note that this Commission has accommodated several witnesses, several attorneys and has made itself available in order to get a full and proper picture and it is my view and my submission that a statement from Mr. Campbell, even at this late stage would assist this Commission. So I would ask that we be allowed to submit this statement. I think we can finalize this statement and have it before the Commission by tomorrow and that Mr. Campbell be allowed to give his evidence-in-chief, so to speak, next Thursday when he is already scheduled to

24

23

つち

1		be before this Commission.
2	COMM. BOGLE:	The Commission has no problem with
3		Mr. Campbell providing and submitting a
4		witness statement or summary as he is
5		guided, the Commission has no problem.
6		As I said before that could have and
7		should have done long ago, based on our
8		request. At least I am happy to see
9		that some semblance of recognition of
10		the importance of the provision of such
11		a statement is finally coming out from
12		FINSAC or if I should duly credit the
13		firm for that because surely I have to
14		look to put it somewhere and I have to
15		put it to you and your firm to recognize
16		something that FINSAC did not recognize.
17		As I said, we will proceed and you will
18		provide the statement to us as early as
19		possible so that we may have it
20		circulated.
21	MR. MOODIE:	we certainly will. And so today
22		therefore, Mr. Campbell will be
23		responding to specific questions from
24		the Commission which arise from the
25		document.

1	COMM. BOGLE:	No, we will simply this morning be
2		looking to ensure that we get the
3		documents that we have requested and see
4		which one is outstanding. So it will be
5 6	MR. MOODIE:	a short sitting today. Iam grateful.
7	COMM. BOGLE:	Mr. DePeralto, you wish to challenge
8	MR. DEPERALTO:	No, no, I just wish to clarify two
9		matters raised by the attorney
10		representing FINSAC.
11		In the first instance, all the
12		transcripts and witness statements up to
13		date were transmitted to Samuda and
14		Johnson on the 21st of April, not
15		yesterday afternoon. The firm responded
16		to say that certain transcripts and
17		witness statements had not been received
18		and that was again sent out by Miss
19		Johnson yesterday afternoon.
20		On matter of the rescheduling of
21		Mr. Campbell's appearance, when we met
22		on the 18th Mr. Campbell was already
23		scheduled to have attended at the
24		Commission and in that meeting it was
25		agreed that we would put him back to the

1		3rd; so that was the first rescheduling
2		of Mr. Campbell's appearance. So the two
3		weeks' request is a further extension.
4		Now, from the Secretariat's point of
5		view, when information is transmitted it
6		is automatically date stamped by the
7		computer and unless there is a
8		communication from the other end that it
9		has not been received, the Secretariat
10		will not know, because in these cases we
11		did not receive a message from the
12		postmaster which says that the mail had
13		not been delivered. So if we have
14		promised to send anything and it has not
15		been received in a timely manner, then
16		please communicate with the Secretariat
17		so that we can resend it.
18	MR. MOODIE:	I hope I didn't give the impression that
19		we did not receive anything prior to
20		yesterday, that was not the impression I
21		intended to convey. In fact, Commission,
22		you will note that I indicated the
23		particular transcript which we received
24		yesterday which we had not received
25		before. Miss Johnson and Mr. DePeralto

1		have sought to facilitate us and to be
2		fair, we have been getting transcripts
3		almost every day, the transcripts of
4		proceedings which have passed and up to
5		yesterday we had, in response to our
6		request, our notifying the Secretariat
7		that certain documents and transcripts
8		were not yet provided, and we received
9		those. So I did not mean to give the
10		impression that we did not get anything.
11	COMM. BOGLE:	Okay thank you very much. May we have
12 13		Mr. Campbell sworn in. MR. CAMPBELL CALLED AND SWORN
14		Thank you. Mr. Campbell, as you are
14 15		Thank you. Mr. Campbell, as you are well aware, there were a number of
		-
15		well aware, there were a number of
15 16		well aware, there were a number of documents and information that you were
15 16 17		well aware, there were a number of documents and information that you were supposed to provide to this Commission.
15 16 17 18		well aware, there were a number of documents and information that you were supposed to provide to this Commission. Some of these requests were before your
15 16 17 18 19	MR. CAMPBELL:	well aware, there were a number of documents and information that you were supposed to provide to this Commission. Some of these requests were before your appearance at the Commission and some of
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR. CAMPBELL: MR. MOODIE:	well aware, there were a number of documents and information that you were supposed to provide to this Commission. Some of these requests were before your appearance at the Commission and some of them emanated from the Commission. Do you have a list of the documents?
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22		well aware, there were a number of documents and information that you were supposed to provide to this Commission. Some of these requests were before your appearance at the Commission and some of them emanated from the Commission. Do you have a list of the documents? I will check, Mr. Commissioner.

1	MR. CAMPBELL:	Mr. Chairman, I do not have all the
2		letters. The letter of July 5, minutes
3		of meetings of FINSAC and associated
4		companies, those minutes have been
5 6	COMM. BOGLE:	submitted to the Commission. All of them?
7	MR. CAMPBELL:	The only thing we have outstanding as
8		the attorney mentioned is the minutes of
9		meetings of the Credit Committee. It is
10		about six boxes or seven boxes, and we
11		endeavour to get that to you by
12		tomorrow.
13	COMM. BOGLE:	item 2 you have a copy of the letter
14 15	MR. CAMPBELL:	with you? Yes, we have.
16 17	COMM. BOGLE:	We could go through the items. The first one is the Minutes, the Credit
18		Committee Minutes, those are still
19		outstanding.
20	MR. CAMPBELL:	Item 2 is a list of Special Auditors,
21		Forensic Auditors and Receivers and the
22		reports. The list was prepared, I am
23		not sure if it was sent to the
24		Commission, if not it can be submitted
25		by Monday. So I will double check.

1	COMM. BOGLE:	And note that it says 'and the reports
2		filed by of these parties'.
3	MR. CAMPBELL:	Yes, sir.
4	COMM. BOGLE:	So you will double check.
5	MR. CAMPBELL:	Yes, sir.
6	COMM. BOGLE:	If it is not yet provided you will
7		provide it by Monday?
8	MR. CAMPBELL:	Sure. Item Number 3 is the list of
9		attorneys engaged and/or employed by
10		FINSAC and its associated companies.
11		This was compiled, I really don't know
12		if it was sent, if it is not I will
13		check and send it to you by tomorrow.
14	COMM. BOGLE:	Yes. Item Number 4, the list of persons
15		holding the office of Board of Directors
16		and Secretary for FINSAC and each of its
17		associated companies. This was
18		submitted, I believe, on the 25th of
19		February.
20	COMM. BOGLE:	25th of February this year?
21	MR. CAMPBELL:	Yes. Item Number 5, the list of
22		securities disposed of by FINSAC and its
23		associated companies to JRF. The
24		question that is asked to do, it is not
25		information that we can provide, Mr.

1		Chairman. The list of securities at the point
2		of the loans were sold, all the securities
۷		that relate to it would have
4		been transferred to JRF as well. We
5		didn't keep a specific list.
6	COMM. BOGLE:	There is no list of securities?
7 8	MR. CAMPBELL: COMM. BOGLE:	No. What about securities disposed to other
9		persons or other persons relative to be
10		securities? FINSAC, I am sure would
11		have disposed of certain securities to
12		persons other than JRF and this is also
13		what we are asking for, a list of those
14		and the valuations that would have been
15		associated with the pricing and sale of
16 17	MR. CAMPBELL:	those loans. You would have the specific list of
18		securities go along with the loans.
19 20	COMM. BOGLE:	There was no list of securities. I am sure that FINSAC did sell certain
21 22	MR. CAMPBELL:	securities individually. Well, that information was provided to
23		the Commission previously of the
24		properties sold including the
25		valuations, the name of the valuators,

1		that list was previously sent to the
2		Commission.
3	COMM. BOGLE:	You are now saying that when it comes to
4		the loans that were transferred or
5		disposed in any way, shape or form, the
6		securities that went with those loans,
7		there was no list retained by FINSAC of
8		those?
9	MR. CAMPBELL:	That is correct, sir.
10	COMM. BOGLE:	Which sort of brings me to a question
11		that I think came up earlier the last
12		time you were here and that had to do
13		with someone being placed in JRF to
14		ensure that when securities are to be
15		disposed of, that person would then vet
16		the information, am I right?
17	MR. CAMPBELL:	That is correct.
18	COMM. BOGLE:	Now, FINSAC does not have a list of
19		securities and therefore depend solely
20		on that person in JRF, if that person
21		does not report properly on something
22		there is nothing in FINSAC to
23		cross-check to say hold on there, this
24		security we have not heard anything from
25		so if JRF tomorrow morning says that is

1		it, we have sold all the securities, we
2		have completed good by FINSAC would
3		not therefore be able to say hold on
4		there, are these securities that we have
5 6	MR. CAMPBELL:	not seen coming forward? That is correct. As I said we didn't
7		have a specific list of the items. What
8		we are assured of in the security vault
9		at JRF, there are two persons who are in
10		possession of the key, one
11 12	COMM. BOGLE:	representative being ourselves. Mr. Campbell, I hear what you say. I
13		think that is a basis for a lot of
14		things, because if I am selling
15		something or signing or transferring
16		something and I have some residual
17		interest in it, then I surely want to
18		know that I have a copy of that so that
19		when I get the monthly reports to say
20		well, these properties have been sold or
21		these securities were disposed of that I
22		could go to my master list and tick them
23		off so that at the end of the period,
24		five years' time, one month's time, ten
25		years' time when JRF says we have done

1		all we can, we have disposed of
2		everything, we are now packing up and
3		closing shop, whatever it is we can go
4		back to that master list and say, hold
5		on, these two are outstanding. That is
6		poor control.
7	MR. CAMPBELL:	We do have the option and we exercise it
8		from time to time to do an audit of all
9		the actions and we are
10	COMM. BOGLE:	The problem is that, without simply
11		going over and say what do you have here
12		- okay, we will move on to item 6.
13	MR. CAMPBELL:	Item 6, simply we did not obtain a list
14		from institutions from which we got the
15		loans. We need to provide this kind of
16		information.
17	COMM. BOGLE:	Again, the institutions themselves -
18		well, from what we heard earlier and
19		which you will have your time making a
20		statement, from what we heard is that
21		FINSAC overall, of the loans and all of
22		the securities of all those
23		organizations, of the ones we are not
24		talking about any particular one now,
25		and a list was not made of what was

1		taken over so therefore, one could have
2		well say any number could have fallen
3		through the cracks because we don't know
4		what we took over.
5	MR. CAMPBELL:	I suppose there is almost a possibility.
6		The list that we get is the list of
7		names and balances outstanding and the
8		security files and credit files came
9		along.
10	COMM. BOGLE:	All right, you say this was previously
11		provided?
12	MR. CAMPBELL:	I am saying we don't have it.
13	COMM. BOGLE:	You haven't? Item 7.
14	MR. CAMPBELL:	Item 7 relates to retrieval of
15		information from JRF. We have not made
16		any requests other than what my friend
17		just mentioned. In recent discussions
18		they have agreed to provide us with
19		files so that we will be able to get
20		some information to respond to some of
21		the allegations made by the debtors that
22		have made representation.
23	COMM. BOGLE:	So all of this you will be able to
24		retrieve them and therefore we will be
25		able to respond adequately to the ones,

1		we call it allegations or questions that
2		appear in the transcripts.
3	MR. CAMPBELL:	Sure.
4	COMM. BOGLE:	We will take a short recess to see if we
5		will get back the power. We have lost
6		it.
7		BREAK.
8		Okay, this Enquiry is back in session.
9		Mr. Campbell, you are still under oath.
10		At this time, Mr. Moodie, you would be
11		aware of a number of questions or the
12		list of questions that were sent to Mr.
13		Campbell from FINSAC and his responses.
14		There were quite a few gaps in his
15		response and what I would ask is that on
16		Mr. Campbell's return that he will be
17		prepared to fill all those gaps which
18		you may take him through as well because
19		the gaps also stated, apart from those
20		in his response, the gaps would have
21		been stated in the transcripts. So on
22		his return that will be addressed as
23 24	MR. CAMPBELL:	well. We certainly intend to do so, Mr.
25		Chairman. I just wish to indicate that

1		the agreement between FINSAC and
2		Jamaican Redevelopment Foundation
3		contemplates or provides that FINSAC
4		would have access to the documentation
5		relevant to those accounts and the items
6		which were transferred and so certainly,
7		in fulfilling our duty we intend and we
8		have communicated with Counsel from
9		Jamaican Redevelopment Foundation, we
10		intend to see how far that can take us
11		in answering some of the questions and
12		filling some of the gaps you have
13 14	COMM. BOGLE:	referred to. Are there any questions from other
15		Counsel present?
16	MRS. PHILLIPS:	I just want to clarify something,
17		Chairman and your members. A statement
18		was made that we would be sending the
19		file to FINSAC, that is not quite
20		reflective of the situation. What we
21		
		will do is provide certain documents
22		will do is provide certain documents from the file and requests needed and
22		_
		from the file and requests needed and

1		The agreement reference also provides
2		that all communication with the debtors
3		subsequent to the transfer date is the
4		exclusive prerogative and responsibility
5		of Jamaican Redevelopment Foundation. So
6		to the extent that we can co-operate
7		within the spirit of our agreement and
8		the terms of our agreement, we certainly
9		have no difficulty do so.
10	COMM. BOGLE:	Thank you. All right, if there is no
11		other matter for this morning I will
12		adjourn this meeting until Tuesday
13		morning at 9:30. Mr. Patrick Hylton is
14		supposed to be coming for Tuesday and
15		Wednesday and FINSAC will return on
16		Thursday. Hopefully we will be able to
17		be taken to the completion of the
18		examination of FINSAC thereafter.
19	MRS. PHILLIPS:	One more thing. In relation to this
20		material which is being submitted to the
21		Commission by FINSAC, would other
22		parties be able to have access? T certainly
23		don't want to receive a truck load of boxes.
24		I have no desire to receive a truck load of
		boxes myself.

1	COMM. BOGLE:	Yes, this is one of the reasons
2	MRS. PHILLIPS:	I just wanted to know if we will have
3		access to anything we need.
4	COMM. BOGLE:	This is one of the reasons we ask that
5		EINSAC provides the statement early so
6		that we can circulate it to the parties
7		involved. Okay, thank you very much.
8		This Enquiry is now adjourned until
9		Tuesday morning.
10		ADJOURMENT
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		